

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

“Change content and aid effectiveness: How the size of change content affects implementation of technical assistance recommendations in developing Pacific Island countries.”

A 152.785 (30 credit) research report
presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Masters of Management at Massey University

MARGARET ELIZABETH COTTON

2008

Abstract

International aid agencies offer development aid with the expectation that developing countries will transform to such an extent that they can look after themselves, yet many countries have not developed as expected. This study identifies how the size of the change content of technical assistance recommendations affects their implementation: Technical assistance recommendations from the Pacific Financial Technical Assistance Centre, Fiji, to developing Pacific Island countries were studied. A content analysis was conducted to assess size using traditional transactional and transformational change definitions, and a survey questionnaire was used to assess size from the perspective of the technical assistance recipients. The content analysis findings suggest the majority of the changes are transactional, whereas, the recipients have rated the majority of the changes as large. The recipient's perspective of size was most indicative of the likely implementation of the change. Changes rated as 'small' by the recipients are almost certain to be implemented whereas changes rated as 'large' have only a one-in-three chance of being implemented. If technical assistance recommendations are transactional manageable reforms in the eyes of aid agencies but are not seen the same way by recipients the chances a recommendation will be implemented, and the technical assistance successful, are compromised. The study supports the notion that to be effective technical assistance recommendations need to be seen through the eyes of the recipient.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Table of Contents	iii
List of Tables.....	v
List of Figures.....	vi
Acknowledgements	vii
Chapter 1: Change Content and Aid Effectiveness	1
1.1 <i>Contextual Background</i>	1
1.2 <i>Purpose of the Research</i>	1
1.3 <i>Research Question</i>	2
1.4 <i>Importance of the Research</i>	2
1.5 <i>Overview of Research Methods</i>	3
1.6 <i>Overview of the Findings</i>	4
1.7 <i>Organisation of the Research Report</i>	5
Chapter 2: Study Context	7
2.1 <i>Context and Setting</i>	7
2.2 <i>Development Aid</i>	7
2.3 <i>The International Monetary Fund's Technical Assistance Programme</i>	8
2.3.1 <i>The Pacific Financial Technical Assistance Centre</i>	9
2.4 <i>Summary</i>	9
Chapter 3: Literature Review	10
3.1 <i>The Aid Conundrum</i>	10
3.1.1 <i>Aid effectiveness studies are fraught.</i>	11
3.1.2 <i>Can development aid assist transformational change?</i>	14
3.2 <i>Change Literature</i>	15
3.2.1 <i>Themes of change management.</i>	15
3.2.2 <i>Transactional and transformational change.</i>	16
3.2.3 <i>The macro-micro debate: perspective of size matters.</i>	17
3.3 <i>The Intersection of Technical Assistance Aid and Change Management</i>	19
3.4 <i>Cross-Cultural Management Sounds a Caution</i>	21
3.5 <i>Summary</i>	22
Chapter 4: Research Method	24
4.1 <i>The Research Question</i>	24
4.2 <i>Population and Sample Selection</i>	24
4.3 <i>Choosing an Assessment Model</i>	25
4.4 <i>Data Collection</i>	27
4.5 <i>Data Analysis</i>	29
4.5.1 <i>Content analysis.</i>	29
4.5.2 <i>Analysing the recommendations.</i>	32
4.5.3 <i>Statistical analysis.</i>	33
4.6 <i>Reliability and Validity</i>	33
4.6.1 <i>Content analysis.</i>	33
4.6.2 <i>Survey questionnaire.</i>	34
4.7 <i>Ethical Considerations</i>	34
4.7.1 <i>Risk of harm</i>	34
4.7.2 <i>Informed and voluntary consent.</i>	35
4.7.3 <i>Conflict of interest</i>	35
4.8 <i>Assumptions and Limitations</i>	36
4.9 <i>Summary</i>	37

Chapter 5: Findings	38
5.1 Findings from the Document Review.....	38
5.2 Findings from the Survey Questionnaire	39
5.2.1 Size of the recommendations.	40
5.2.2 Outcome of the recommendations.	41
5.2.3 Status of the recommendations.....	43
5.2.4 Factors determining size and status of the recommendations.....	45
5.2.5 Findings from general questions	46
5.3 Findings from the Content Analysis.....	48
5.4 Linking the Questionnaire Findings and the Content Analysis	50
5.4.1 Difference between respondents' perspectives of size and content analysis.	50
5.4.2 Difference in outcome between respondents' perspective and content analysis.	51
5.4.3 Difference in status between respondents' perspective of size and the content analysis assessment of size.	53
5.5 Summary of Findings	55
Chapter 6: Discussion.....	57
6.1 Themes from the Literature Review.....	57
6.1.1 Myth or reality - technical assistance recommendations are still transformational.	57
6.1.2 Myth or reality – to be successful changes need to be seen through the eyes of the recipient.....	59
6.1.3 Myth or reality - large changes can be overwhelming and can lead to paralysis... ..	60
6.1.4 Myth or reality – a strategy of small wins might be preferable.....	60
6.1.5 Myth or reality – North American theories in non-North American countries are ethnocentric and expensive.....	61
6.1.6 Myth or reality - the size of a change or series of changes depends on the perspective of the observer.	62
6.2 Support for Reception-based Content Analysis	62
6.3 Autonomy and Ownership or Paternalism.....	63
6.4 Summary	63
Chapter 7: Conclusion	65
7.1 Summary of the Study.....	65
7.2 The Recipient's Perspective of Size Matters Most.....	66
7.3 The Size of the Change Content does Affect Implementation	67
References	70
Appendices	73
Appendix 1: Letter Requesting Access to PFTAC reports	73
Appendix 2: Example Covering Letter	76
Appendix 3: Participant Information Sheet.....	77
Appendix 4: Sample Questionnaire.....	79
Appendix 5: Content Analysis – Coding Dictionary	81
Appendix 6: Content Analysis – Coding Form.....	82
Appendix 7: Size of Recommendations by Country.....	83
Appendix 8: Outcome of Recommendations by Country.....	84
Appendix 9: Status of Recommendations by Country and Size	85
Appendix 10: Respondents' Responses to the General Questions	86
Appendix 11: Content Analysis – Size of Recommendations by Country.....	87
Appendix 12: Content Analysis – Outcome of Recommendations by Country.....	88
Appendix 13: Content Analysis - Status of Recommendations by Country.....	89

List of Tables

Table 1: Missions, Documents and Recommendations by Country	38
Table 2: Summary: Outcome of the Recommendations by Size	43
Table 3: Summary: Status of the Recommendations by Size	44
Table 4: Size of Recommendations by Country	83
Table 5: Outcome of Recommendations by Country	84
Table 6: Status of Recommendations by Country and Size	85
Table 7: Content Analysis – Size of Recommendations by Country	87
Table 8: Content Analysis – Outcome of Recommendations by Country	88
Table 9: Content Analysis – Status of Recommendations by Country and Year	89

List of Figures

Figure 1: Summary: Respondents' Ratings - Size of the Recommendations	40
Figure 2: Summary: Outcome of the Recommendations	42
Figure 3: Summary: Respondents - Factors Affecting Size	45
Figure 4: Summary: Respondents - Factors Affecting Status	46
Figure 5: Summary: Content Analysis – Change Factors	49
Figure 6: Difference between Respondents' Perspectives of Size and Content Analysis	51
Figure 7: Summary: Content Analysis – Outcome of Recommendations	52
Figure 8: Difference in Outcome between Respondents' Perspectives and Content Analysis	53
Figure 9: Summary Content Analysis – Status of Recommendations	53
Figure 10: Summary: Status of Recommendations – Comparison between Content Analysis and Respondent's Perspectives	54

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Dr Alan Coezter for his able supervision throughout the research project.

I would particularly like to thank Dr Susan Adams, PFTAC Co-ordinator, for agreeing to make the PFTAC reports available to me, without this there could have been no project. Elenoa Bogiwalu, PFTAC Administration officer, also assisted with the locating the documents and copying them for me.

I would also like to thank the Hon. Siosua U'toikamanu, former Minister of Finance Tonga; Mr Shadrach Fanega, Permanent Secretary Department of Finance and Treasury Solomon Islands; and Mr Finley Perman, Secretary of Finance and Administration, Federated States of Micronesia for generously giving their time to assist with this study.

Thank you to Pamela Todd, for generously giving her time and knowledge to assist with editing and structuring the report.

Finally I would like to thank Carson McNeill, PFTAC Tax Policy and Revenue Administration Advisor, for his support and encouragement during the project: I will remember that P is for perseverance.

Change content and aid effectiveness : how the size of change content affects implementation of technical assistance recommendations in developing Pacific Island countries

Cotton, Margaret

2008

<http://hdl.handle.net/10179/1144>

14/03/2024 - Downloaded from MASSEY RESEARCH ONLINE